Selection and parallel trends*

Dalia Ghanem[†] Pedro H. C. Sant'Anna[‡] Kaspar Wüthrich[§] First draft on arXiv: March 17, 2022. This draft: September 28, 2022

Abstract

We study the connection between selection into treatment and the parallel trends assumptions underlying difference-in-differences (DiD) designs. We start by deriving necessary and sufficient conditions for the (unconditional) parallel trends assumption. These conditions demonstrate that parallel trends cannot hold absent restrictions on the selection mechanism and/or the distribution of (time-varying) unobservable determinants of the outcome. We then consider different restrictions on the selection mechanism and provide a menu of interpretable primitive sufficient conditions, which constitute a formal framework for justifying DiD in practice. We derive results for both separable and nonseparable outcome models and show that this distinction has implications for the role of covariates in making parallel trends assumptions more plausible. Building on our analysis of nonseparable models, we connect DiD to the literature on nonparametric identification in panel models.

Keywords: causal inference, conditional parallel trends, covariates, difference-in-differences, selection mechanism, time-invariant and time-varying unobservables, treatment effects

JEL Codes: C21, C23

^{*}We are grateful to Dmitry Arkhangelsky, Brantly Callaway, Clément de Chaisemartin, Gordon Dahl, Stefan Hoderlein, Nikolay Kudrin, David McKenzie, Vitor Possebom, Niklas Potrafke, Jonathan Roth, Yuya Sasaki, seminar participants at UCSD and Monash University, and conference participants at the California Econometrics Conference 2022 and the CESifo Area Conference on Labor Economics 2022 for comments. The usual disclaimer applies.

[†]Department of Agricultural & Resource Economics, University of California, Davis. One Shields Ave, Davis CA 95616; dghanem@ucdavis.edu

[‡]Microsoft and Department of Economics, Vanderbilt University. 14820 NE 36th St, Redmond 98052, WA; psantanna@microsoft.com

[§]Department of Economics, University of California San Diego, 9500 Gilman Dr. La Jolla, CA 92093; CESifo; Ifo Institute. kwuthrich@ucsd.edu